Value Chain Workshop Summary:
Enhancing the Economic Value of Vermont’s Woodlands

Wednesday, April 1, 2015, 9:00 am – 1:00 pm
Three Stallion Inn, Randolph, Vermont

Participants

Facilitators:
Shanna Ratner and Melissa Levy, Yellow Wood Associates

WLEB:
Jared Duval
Paul Frederick
Chelsea Bardot Lewis
Lauren Masseria
Joe Nelson
Kathleen Wanner

Invited Participants:
Elise Tillinghast, Northern Woodlands
Dan Kilborn, Vermont Land Trust
Marshall Webb, Shelburne Farms
Ian Hartman, VT Farm and Forest Viability Program
Joel Currier, Currier Farms
Sarah Downes, Cold Hollow Career Center
Carl Powden, Vermont Land Trust
Lisa Sausville, Vermont Coverts
Lucas Jenson, The TreeHouse Hardwoods and Millshop
Chris Castano, Champlain Hardwoods
Ken Gagnon, Gagnon Lumber
Rocky Bunnell, Logger
Sean Ross, Lyme Timber
Chris Fife, Plum Creek
Nancy Patch, Vermont Dept. of Forest, Parks and Recreation
Andy Wood, VACC/VEDA
Patricia Ayres Crawford, Trust for Public Land
Put Blodgett, Vermont Woodlands Association
Opportunity Selection
The top two opportunities from the previous three value chain workshops were presented and described. The group selected four of the six to examine in greater depth at this workshop. The two opportunities that were not examined by this group were: 1) Local engineered wood products for use in residential and commercial construction (from the construction value chain workshop) and 2) Create and consistently supply ultra-high quality wood chips, wood pellets, and firewood (from the wood energy value chain workshop).

Value Chain Analysis by Opportunity

Reach Out to Consumers with a Unified Message about Wood Energy Based on What Is Important to Consumers
The opportunity is to expand the use of wood for energy, particularly thermal. This is already part of Vermont’s policy to increase our use of renewables. The unified message about wood energy includes benefits of keeping forests as forests, cutting trees to cultivate forests, positive impacts on the local economy, reliability of supply of product, price stability, positive environmental impact, and local pride.

The group that worked on how to align the value chain to support a unified message about wood energy identified the following functions that needed to address demand. The functions with a (T) are primarily transactional player functions and those with an (S) are primarily supporting player functions. They are arranged in approximate order from consumer to raw materials. The gaps are in bold.

- Raise public awareness of the “good” including cultural, social, environmental and economic benefits of heating with wood (T) & (S)
- Enact policies and programs that remove polluting wood appliances from the landscape (S)
- Improve transparency and communication throughout the chain about demand trends and opportunities (T)
- Coordination for reliable supply (T)
- Willingness and ability to pay competitive prices for raw materials (competition from pulp markets) (T)
- Bring together group to work with communities that are considering community systems (T)
- Increase in-state pellet processing capacity (T)
- Increase low grade wood markets in southern Vermont (T)
- Increase efficiencies throughout the chain through increased collaboration and consolidation (T) & (S)
- Increase trucking efficiencies (T)
- Train loggers as service providers to landowners helping landowners meet their goals, not just tree harvesters (S)
- Provide loggers and foresters with landowner communication materials with unified message (S)
- Make the connection between community systems and local loggers and landowners (T)
• Provide a clearinghouse of information on availability of raw materials (T)
• Coordinate harvesting for wood chips (T)
• Advertise to landowners (using the unified message) (T)
• Provide demonstration sites for landowners to visit that show how harvesting low end products is good for the forest and compatible with other landowner goals (T)
• Build trust between landowners and loggers and use word of mouth to spread (T)
• Implement a requirement for landowner training for landowners in current use (S)
• Use a notification of harvest system as a communication tool to improve awareness of supply (T) & (S)
• Collect information on longer term intentions to harvest and identify inventory kept on the stump (T) & (S)

Create Demand for Entry-Level Furniture Products for Younger Customers
The opportunity is to design and manufacture high quality basic furniture (e.g. beds, tables, etc.) at a price point that is affordable for young people that can go on to become lifetime customers of fine furniture makers.

The group that worked on how to align the value chain to support value-added producers of entry-level products identified the following functions that are needed to meet demand. The functions with a (T) are primarily transactional player functions and those with an (S) are primarily supporting player functions. They are arranged in approximate order from consumer to raw materials. The gaps are in bold.

• Aggregating demand among furniture producers (T)
• Inventory held at the mills or closer up the chain to the value-added producers (T)
• More lead time in ordering raw materials from mills; a year for popular species (T)
• Increase use of less popular species that require less lead time (T)
• Statewide (or region-wide) lumber inventory system for Vermont and/or northern forest lumber (T)
• Value chain coordination (T) & (S)

Make Maple and Local Species a Trend
The opportunity is to create a “buzz” around the use of maple and other local species, including species that are currently underutilized, by better understanding what appeals to consumers about different species and research species characteristics and alternative uses; for example, using the rot resistant qualities of tamarack in outdoor furniture.

The group that worked on the value chain related to making maple and local species a trend identified the following functions needed to make maple and local species a trend. The functions with a (T) are
transactional player functions primarily and those with an (S) are supporting player functions. They are arranged in approximate order from consumers to raw materials. Gaps are in bold.

- Marketing and Education to consumer (S)
- Figuring out what is attractive to customers about each species (T) & (S)
- Creating stories (T) & (S)
- Retail (T)
- Engaging architects to spec these types of furniture (T)
- Finding opportunities for the consumer to be a co-producer; connecting the product to an experience (T)
- Incentives for choosing local species (T)
- Developing staining for maple (T)
- Apprenticeship opportunities for potential furniture makers to experiment with wood (S)
- Designs using maple and local species (T) & (S)
- Milling to shorter lengths (T)
- Reducing lag time and improving communications throughout the chain (T)
- Improving timing and reducing waste through pre-processing materials (T)
- Managing ownership of material as it moves through the chain (T)
- Faster kiln drying (T)
- Anchor buyer(s) at the lumber level (T)
- Holding inventory (T)
- Aggregating wood inputs (T)
- Data center for information about what is available and who needs what (T) and (S)
- Transporting inventory in Vermont (T)
- Coordination of pick-ups and drop-offs between truckers and logyards (T)
- Logyards, Processing and Mills for other species (T)
- Catalog (link) to wood availability in the Northern Forest; knowing where to source local (T)
- Chain of custody identification for local wood (T) & (S)
- Group certification (to a Vermont standard?) (T) & (S)
- Long-term ordering of raw materials (T)
- Equipment suppliers (T)
- Technical Training and logger training (S)
- Using consulting foresters to create a raw material inventory with landowners (S)
- Understanding the different ways local species can be utilized (S)

Some questions, clarifications and additional thoughts that emerged from this discussion include:

- Questions about who would hold inventory, how it would be financed, and how it would be owned as it moves through the chain.
• Need for research on utilization of local species and assumptions about utilization that need to be tested
• Interest in saying that furniture is grown, sourced and manufactured in Vermont.
• Questions about how to get appropriately scaled equipment to an operator on a more affordable basis.
• Need for landowner education on equipment, market demands and forest health.
• Possibility of having consulting forests coordinate with realtors to address the turnover in land.
• For other species like birch, the entire chain beyond truckers is a gap.
• Story is about good stewardship of the land. Need for redundant messaging.
• Scale is a gap.
• Need for communication and relationships across chain.

Meet Market Demand for Solid Sawn Lumber
The opportunity is to meet market demand for bridges and landscaping, including covered bridges (spruce), ski lodges, rest areas, universities, residential and commercial construction that use solid sawn wood timbers from Vermont.

The group that worked on solid-sawn wood timbers identified the following functions needed to address demand. The functions with a (T) are primarily transactional player functions and those with an (S) are primarily supporting player functions. They are arranged in approximate order from consumer to raw materials. The gaps are in bold.

• Raise market awareness among out of state clients (T) & (S)
• Target “new” Vermonter, upper middle class and build product demand (T) & (S)
• Connect with demand through architects, engineers, realtors, designers (T) & (S)
• Create stories (T) & (S)
• Transporters to job sites (T)
• Aggregation (T)
• Data center for information about what is available and who needs what (T) and (S)
• Enough skilled timber framers to meet demand, especially for larger commercial projects (T)
• Training for landowners, loggers, foresters, timber framers, appraisers, others (S)
• Transporters for large timbers (T)
• Kilns that can handle long material and large material; more kiln operators with appropriate technology and knowledge to dry this material (T)
• Proper grading of timbers to facilitate mixing grades (T)
• Mills with the capacity to handle long and large timbers (T)
• Log aggregation, woodyards with stocks of large timbers (T)
• Standing timber assessment (T)
• Education of landowners, loggers, and foresters to recognize trees with potential (T) & (S)
Some clarifications and questions that emerged from this discussion include:

- The cost of timber framing is 20% greater than the cost of a traditional stick built home. The market is relatively upscale – mostly “recent” Vermonters and out-of-staters.
- Solid sawn timbers refer to timbers < 6 x 6; heavy timbers refer to timbers > 8 x 8; anything under 6 x 6 could be kiln dried.
- Grade mix is important.
- Existing regulations around grade are much more of an issue in commercial than in residential markets.
- Are there enough timber framers out there to make use of materials?
- Are existing Vermont companies large enough to take on large commercial projects?
- Need for communication and relationships across chain.
- Connection with architects is key. They will spec the wood.
- Need for a data center that could keep track of what is available and who is seeking what.
- Career centers and technical training is an important support function with both woodland education, sustainability, equipment education etc.
- Landowner cooperative could be important function for education in creating a consistent supply.
- Incentives are needed to hold wood longer to grow longer.

### Attendance by Position(s) in the Value Chain

**DEMAND PARTNERS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business/Org</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Northern Woodlands</td>
<td>Elise Tillinghast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State of Vermont</td>
<td>Paul Frederick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Champlain Hardwoods</td>
<td>Chris Castano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TreeHouse Hardwoods/Millshop</td>
<td>Lucas Jenson</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TRANSACTIONAL PARTNERS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Function</th>
<th>Business/Org</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Financing for landowners</td>
<td>VT Housing and Conservation</td>
<td>Ian Hartman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financing for landowners</td>
<td>Vermont Land Trust</td>
<td>Carl Powden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financing for landowners</td>
<td>Vermont Land Trust</td>
<td>Dan Kilborn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landowner</td>
<td>Plum Creek</td>
<td>Chris Fife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landowner</td>
<td>Currier Farms</td>
<td>Joel Currier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landowner</td>
<td>Lyme Timber</td>
<td>Sean Ross</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Vermont Forestry Industry Systems Analysis – Value Chain Workshop Summary: Enhancing the Economic Value of Vermont’s Woodlands

### Landowner
- **RJ Turner Co.**
  - Robert Turner
- **Shelburne Farms**
  - Marshall Webb
- **Rocky Bunnell logging**
  - Rocky Bunnell
- **Vermont Land Trust**
  - Carl Powden
- **Vermont Land Trust**
  - Dan Kilborn
- **Gagnon Lumber**
  - Ken Gagnon

### Foresters
- **Upland Forestry**
  - Joe Nelson
- **R. J. Turner Co.**
  - Robert Turner
- **Rocky Bunnel Logging**
  - Rocky Bunnell
- **Currier Farms Logging**
  - Joel Currier
- **Gagnon Lumber**
  - Ken Gagnon

### Loggers
- **Rocky Bunnell logging**
  - Rocky Bunnell
- **Currier Farms Logging**
  - Joel Currier
- **Gagnon Lumber**
  - Ken Gagnon

### Truckers
- **Rocky Bunnell Logging**
  - Rocky Bunnell
- **Gagnon Lumber**
  - Ken Gagnon

### Processors (mills)
- **Currier Farms**
  - Joel Currier
- **Gagnon Lumber**
  - Ken Gagnon

### Wholesalers/Brokers
- **Rocky Bunnel Logging**
  - Rocky Bunnell
- **Champlain hardwoods**
  - Chris Castano

### SUPPORT PARTNERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Function</th>
<th>Business / Org</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Media</td>
<td>Northern Woodlands</td>
<td>Elise Tillinghast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vermont Farm and Forest Viability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Ian Hartman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>RJ Turner Co.</td>
<td>Robert Turner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>Cold Hollow Career Center</td>
<td>Sarah Downes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>WLEB</td>
<td>Joe Nelson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>Vermont Department of Economic Development</td>
<td>Jared Duval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>Vermont Land Trust</td>
<td>Carl Powden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>Vermont Agency of Agriculture, Food and Markets</td>
<td>Lauren Masseria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>VWA/VWMA</td>
<td>Kathleen Wanner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>Vermont Coverts</td>
<td>Lisa Sausville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>Vermont Land Trust</td>
<td>Dan Kilborn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>Trust for Public Land</td>
<td>Patricia Crawford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Assistance Providers</td>
<td>Vermont Department of Economic Development</td>
<td>Jared Duval</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Researchers
- **Vermont Department of Economic Development**
  - Jared Duval
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Organization/Institution</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regulatory Policy</td>
<td>Vermont Department of Economic Development</td>
<td>Jared Duval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vermont Agency of Agriculture, Food and Markets</td>
<td>Lauren Masseria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulatory Policy</td>
<td>Vermont Forest Parks and Rec.</td>
<td>Paul Frederick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulatory Policy</td>
<td>Rec. U &amp; M</td>
<td>Nancy Patch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financers/funders</td>
<td>Vermont Department of Economic Development</td>
<td>Jared Duval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financers/funders</td>
<td>Trust for Public Land</td>
<td>Patricia Crawford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financers/Funders</td>
<td>VACC/VEDA</td>
<td>Andy Wood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Institutional</td>
<td>Vermont Forest Parks and Rec.</td>
<td>Paul Frederick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Institutional</td>
<td>Vermont Forest Parks and Rec.</td>
<td>Nancy Patch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Providers</td>
<td>Shelburne Farms</td>
<td>Marshall Webb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land conservation /</td>
<td>Trust for Public Land</td>
<td>Patricia Crawford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>environmentalists / ecologists</td>
<td>Vermont Land Trust</td>
<td>Carl Powden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land conservation /</td>
<td>Vermont Land Trust</td>
<td>Dan Kilborn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>environmentalists / ecologists</td>
<td>Cold Hollow Career Center</td>
<td>Sarah Downes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>